

[Submitting Counsel on Signature Page]

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

*IN RE: SOCIAL MEDIA ADOLESCENT
ADDICTION/PERSONAL INJURY
PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION,*

This Document Relates To:

ALL ACTIONS

MDL No. 3047

Case No. 4:22-md-03047-YGR

**TEMPORARY SEALING MOTION RE:
PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO
DEFENDANTS' MOTION TO EXCLUDE
PLAINTIFFS' EXPERTS' GENERAL
CAUSATION OPINIONS FOR FAILURE
TO ACCOUNT FOR SECTION 230 AND
THE FIRST AMENDMENT**

Judge: Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

Magistrate Judge: Hon. Peter H. Kang

Pursuant the Court's Order Setting Sealing Procedures (ECF No. 341), Plaintiffs submit this Temporary Sealing Motion regarding Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Exclude Plaintiffs' Experts' General Causation Opinions for Failure to Account for Section 230 and the First Amendment. Pursuant to that Order, the reasons for sealing (if any) will be addressed in a forthcoming omnibus stipulation or omnibus motion.

Docket No.	Document	Whether document contains a Party's Confidential Information
ECF No. 2409-1	Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Exclude Plaintiffs' Experts' General Causation Opinions for Failure to Account for Section 230 and the First Amendment (Sealed)	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-2	Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Exclude Plaintiffs' Experts' General Causation Opinions for Failure to Account for Section 230 and the First Amendment (Redacted)	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-3	Declaration of Andre M. Mura	Not redacted or sealed
ECF No. 2409-4	Ex. 1, May 16, 2025 Trial Report of Mitch Prinstein, Ph.D.	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-5	Ex. 2, June 13, 2025 Expert Report of Dr. Emilio Ferrara	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-6	Ex. 3, June 13, 2025 Expert Report of Dr. Chris Mattmann	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-7	Ex. 4, July 9, 2025 Expert Report of Sandeep Chatterjee, Ph.D.	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties

		may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-8	Ex. 5, July 9, 2025 Expert Report of Michael Baiocchi, Ph.D.	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-9	Ex. 6, April 18, 2025 Expert Report of Dr. Randy Auerbach	Temporarily filing under seal because document contains information that the parties may consider to be confidential
ECF No. 2409-10	Ex. 7, Exhibit 25 to the Deposition of Brian Boland	Not redacted or sealed

1 DATED: November 7, 2025

2 Respectfully submitted,

3 /s/ Lexi J. Hazan

4 LEXI J. HAZAM

5 **LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &
BERNSTEIN, LLP**

6 275 BATTERY STREET, 29TH FLOOR
7 SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94111-3339

8 Telephone: 415-956-1000

9 lhazam@lchb.com

10 PREVIN WARREN

11 **MOTLEY RICE LLC**

12 401 9th Street NW Suite 630

13 Washington DC 20004

14 T: 202-386-9610

15 pwarren@motleyrice.com

16 Co-Lead Counsel

17 ANDRE M. MURA

18 **GIBBS MURA LLP**

19 1111 Broadway, Suite 2100

20 Oakland, CA 94607

21 Telephone: (510) 350-9700

22 Facsimile: (510) 350-9701

23 amm@classlawgroup.com

24 Plaintiffs Steering Committee Leadership

25 *Attorneys for PI/SD Plaintiffs*

KRIS MAYES

Attorney General
State of Arizona

/s/ Reagan Healey

Reagan Healey (AZ No. 038733), *pro hac vice*
Assistant Attorney General
Arizona Attorney General's Office
2005 North Central Avenue
Phoenix, AZ 85004
Phone: (602) 542-3725
Fax: (602) 542-4377
Reagan.Healey@azag.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff State of Arizona

ROB BONTA

Attorney General
State of California

/s/ Megan O'Neill

Nicklas A. Akers (CA SBN 211222)
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Bernard Eskandari (SBN 244395)
Emily Kalanithi (SBN 256972)
Supervising Deputy Attorneys General
Nayha Arora (CA SBN 350467)
David Beglin (CA SBN 356401)
Megan O'Neill (CA SBN 343535)
Joshua Olszewski-Jubelirer (CA SBN 336428)
Marissa Roy (CA SBN 318773)
Brendan Ruddy (CA SBN 297896)
Deputy Attorneys General
California Department of Justice
Office of the Attorney General
455 Golden Gate Ave., Suite 11000
San Francisco, CA 94102-7004
Phone: (415) 510-4400
Fax: (415) 703-5480
Megan.ONeill@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of California

PHILIP J. WEISER

1 Attorney General
2 State of Colorado

3 /s/ Krista Batchelder

4 Krista Batchelder, (CO Reg.45066), *pro hac vice*
5 Deputy Solicitor General
6 Shannon Stevenson (CO Reg. 35542), *pro hac vice*
7 Solicitor General
8 Elizabeth Orem (CO Reg. 58309), *pro hac vice*
9 Assistant Attorney General
10 Colorado Department of Law
11 Ralph L. Carr Judicial Center
12 Consumer Protection Section
13 1300 Broadway, 7th Floor
14 Denver, CO 80203
15 Phone: (720) 508-6384
16 krista.batchelder@coag.gov
17 Shannon.stevenson@coag.gov
18 Elizabeth.orem@coag.gov

19 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Colorado, ex rel.*
20 *Philip J. Weiser, Attorney General*

21 **WILLIAM TONG**

22 Attorney General
23 State of Connecticut

24 /s/ Rebecca Borné

25 Rebecca Borné
26 (CT Juris No. 446982), *pro hac vice*
27 Tess E. Schneider
28 (CT Juris No. 444175), *pro hac vice*
Krislyn M. Launer
(CT Juris No. 440789), *pro hac vice*
Assistant Attorneys General
Connecticut Office of the Attorney General
165 Capitol Avenue
Hartford, Connecticut 06106
Phone: 860-808-5306
Fax: 860-808-5593
Rebecca.Borne@ct.gov
Tess.Schneider@ct.gov
Krislyn.Launer@ct.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Connecticut

KATHLEEN JENNINGS

Attorney General
State of Delaware

/s/ Ryan Costa

Marion Quirk (DE Bar 4136), *pro hac vice*
Director of Consumer Protection
Ryan Costa (DE Bar 5325), *pro hac vice*
Deputy Director of Consumer Protection
Delaware Department of Justice
820 N. French Street, 5th Floor
Wilmington, DE 19801
Phone: (302) 683-8811
Marion.Quirk@delaware.gov
Ryan.Costa@delaware.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Delaware

ANNE E. LOPEZ

Attorney General
State of Hawai'i

/s/ Douglas S. Chin

Christopher J.I. Leong (HI JD No. 9662), *pro hac vice*
Supervising Deputy Attorney General
Kelcie K. Nagata (HI JD No. 10649), *pro hac vice*
Deputy Attorney General
Department of the Attorney General
Commerce and Economic Development Division
425 Queen Street
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813
Phone: (808) 586-1180
Christopher.ji.leong@hawaii.gov
Kelcie.k.nagata@hawaii.gov
Douglas S. Chin (HI JD No. 6465), *pro hac vice*
John W. Kelly (HI JD No. 9907), *pro hac vice*
Special Deputy Attorney General
Starn O'Toole Marcus & Fisher
733 Bishop Street, Suite 1900
Honolulu, Hawai'i 96813
Phone: (808) 537-6100
dchin@starnlaw.com

1 jkelly@starnlaw.com

2 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Hawai'i*

3 **RAÚL R. LABRADOR**

4 Attorney General
5 State of Idaho

6
7 By: /s/ James Simeri

8 James Simeri (ID Bar No. 12332)
9 Deputy Attorney General
10 Attorney General's Office
11 P.O. Box 83720
12 Boise, ID 83720-0010
13 (208) 334-4114
14 james.simeri@ag.idaho.gov

15 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Idaho*

16 **KWAME RAOUL**

17 Attorney General
18 State of Illinois

19 /s/ Matthew Davies

20 Susan Ellis, Chief, Consumer Protection Division
21 (IL Bar No. 6256460)
22 Greg Grzeskiewicz, Chief, Consumer Fraud
23 Bureau (IL Bar No. 6272322)
24 Jacob Gilbert, Deputy Chief, Consumer Fraud
25 Bureau (IL Bar No. 6306019)
26 Matthew Davies, Assistant Attorney General,
27 Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6299608),
28 *pro hac vice*
Daniel B. Roth, Assistant Attorney General,
Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6290613)
Meera Khan, Assistant Attorney General,
Consumer Fraud Bureau (IL Bar No. 6345895)
Office of the Illinois Attorney General
115 S. LaSalle Street
Chicago, Illinois 60603
312-814-2218
Susan.Ellis@ilag.gov
Greg.Grzeskiewicz@ilag.gov
Jacob.Gilbert@ilag.gov

Matthew.Davies@ilag.gov

Daniel.Roth@ilag.gov

Meera.Khan@ilag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff the People of the State of Illinois

THEODORE E. ROKITA

Attorney General

State of Indiana

/s/ Scott L. Barnhart

Scott L. Barnhart (IN Att’y No. 25474-82)

pro hac vice

Chief Counsel and Director of Consumer

Protection Corinne Gilchrist (IN Att’y No. 27115-53)

pro hac vice

Section Chief, Consumer Litigation

Mark M. Snodgrass (IN Att’y No. 29495-49)

pro hac vice

Deputy Attorney General

Office of the Indiana Attorney General

Indiana Government Center South

302 West Washington St., 5th Floor

Indianapolis, IN 46203

Telephone: (317) 232-6309

Scott.Barnhart@atg.in.gov

Corinne.Gilchrist@atg.in.gov

Mark.Snodgrass@atg.in.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Indiana

KRIS W. KOBACH

Attorney General

State of Kansas

/s/ Sarah Dietz

Sarah Dietz, Assistant Attorney General

(KS Bar No. 27457), *pro hac vice*

Office of the Kansas Attorney General

120 SW 10th Avenue, 2nd Floor

Topeka, Kansas 66612

Telephone: (785) 296-3751

sarah.dietz@ag.ks.gov

Attorney for Plaintiff State of Kansas

RUSSELL COLEMAN

Attorney General
Commonwealth of Kentucky

/s/ J. Christian Lewis

J. Christian Lewis (KY Bar No. 87109),
pro hac vice

Philip Heleringer (KY Bar No. 96748),
pro hac vice

Zachary Richards (KY Bar No. 99209),
pro hac vice

Daniel I. Keiser (KY Bar No. 100264),
pro hac vice

Matthew Cocanougher (KY Bar No. 94292), *pro*
hac vice

Assistant Attorneys General
1024 Capital Center Drive, Ste. 200
Frankfort, KY 40601

Christian.Lewis@ky.gov

Philip.Heleringer@ky.gov

Zach.Richards@ky.gov

Daniel.Keiser@ky.gov

Matthew.Cocanougher@ky.gov

Phone: (502) 696-5300

Fax: (502) 564-2698

Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of
Kentucky

LIZ MURRILL

Attorney General
State of Louisiana

/s/ Asyl Nachabe

Asyl Nachabe (LA Bar No. 38846)
pro hac vice

Assistant Attorney General
Louisiana Department of Justice
Office of the Attorney General
Public Protection Division
Complex Litigation Section
1885 N 3rd Street, 4th Floor

1 Baton Rouge, LA 70802
2 Tel: (225) 326-6435
3 NachabeA@ag.louisiana.gov
4 *Attorney for State of Louisiana*

5 **AARON M. FREY**
6 Attorney General
7 State of Maine

8 /s/ Michael Devine
9 Michael Devine (Maine Bar No. 5048),
10 *pro hac vice*
11 Assistant Attorney General
12 Office of the Maine Attorney General
13 6 State House Station
14 Augusta, ME 04333-0006
15 (207) 626-8829
16 michael.devine@maine.gov
17 *Attorney for Plaintiff State of Maine*

18 **ANTHONY G. BROWN**
19 Attorney General
20 State of Maryland

21 /s/ Elizabeth J. Stern
22 Philip D. Ziperman (Maryland CPF No.
23 9012190379), *pro hac vice*
24 Deputy Chief, Consumer Protection Division
25 Elizabeth J. Stern (Maryland CPF No.
26 1112090003), *pro hac vice*
27 Assistant Attorney General
28 Office of the Attorney General of Maryland
200 St. Paul Place
Baltimore, MD 21202
Phone: (410) 576-6417 (Mr. Ziperman)
Phone: (410) 576-7226 (Ms. Stern)
Fax: (410) 576-6566
pziperman@oag.state.md.us
estern@oag.state.md.us

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Office of the Attorney
General of Maryland*

KEITH ELLISON
Attorney General

State of Minnesota

/s/ Caitlin Micko

Caitlin Micko (MN Bar No. 0395388)
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Minnesota Attorney General
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 600
St. Paul, MN 55101
Tel: (651) 724-9180
Caitlin.micko@ag.state.mn.us

*Attorney for State of Minnesota, by its
Attorney General, Keith Ellison*

MICHAEL T. HILGERS

Attorney General
State of Nebraska

/s/ Anna M. Anderson

Anna M. Anderson (NE #28080)
Assistant Attorney General
pro hac vice
Benjamin J. Swanson (NE #27675)
Assistant Attorney General
Nebraska Attorney General's Office
1445 K Street, Room 2115
Lincoln, NE 68509
(402) 471-6034
anna.anderson@nebraska.gov
benjamin.swanson@nebraska.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Nebraska

MATTHEW J. PLATKIN

Attorney General
State of New Jersey

By: /s/ Kashif T. Chand

Kashif T. Chand (NJ Bar No. 016752008),
Pro hac vice
Assistant Attorney General
Thomas Huynh (NJ Bar No. 200942017),
Pro hac vice
Assistant Section Chief, Deputy Attorney
General

Verna J. Pradaxay (NJ Bar No. 335822021),

Pro hac vice

Mandy K. Wang (NJ Bar No. 373452021),

Pro hac vice

Deputy Attorneys General

New Jersey Office of the Attorney General,

Division of Law

124 Halsey Street, 5th Floor

Newark, NJ 07101

Tel: (973) 648-2052

Kashif.Chand@law.njoag.gov

Thomas.Huynh@law.njoag.gov

Verna.Pradaxay@law.njoag.gov

Mandy.Wang@law.njoag.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiffs Matthew J. Platkin,

Attorney General for the State of New Jersey, and

Elizabeth Harris, Acting Director of the New

Jersey Division of Consumer Affairs

LETITIA JAMES

Attorney General

State of New York

/s/ Nathaniel Kosslyn

Nathaniel Kosslyn, Assistant Attorney General

(NY Bar No. 5773676), *pro hac vice*

nathaniel.kosslyn@ag.ny.gov

Alex Finkelstein, Assistant Attorney General

(NY Bar No. 5609623), *pro hac vice*

alex.finkelstein@ag.ny.gov

New York Office of the Attorney General

28 Liberty Street

New York, NY 10005

(212) 416-8000

JEFF JACKSON

Attorney General

State of North Carolina

/s/ Charles White

Charles G. White (N.C. State Bar No. 57735), *pro*

hac vice

Assistant Attorney General

1 Kunal Choksi
2 Senior Deputy Attorney General
3 Josh Abram
4 Special Deputy Attorney General
5 N.C. Department of Justice
6 Post Office Box 629
7 Raleigh, North Carolina 27602
8 Telephone: (919) 716-6006
9 Facsimile: (919) 716-6050
10 E-mail: cwhite@ncdoj.gov
11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of North Carolina*

12 **DAVE YOST**
13 **OHIO ATTORNEY GENERAL**

14 /s/ Kevin R. Walsh
15 Melissa G. Wright (0077843)
16 Section Chief, Consumer Protection Section
17 Melissa.Wright@ohioago.gov
18 Melissa S. Smith (0083551)
19 Asst. Section Chief, Consumer Protection Section
20 Melissa.S.Smith@ohioago.gov
21 Michael S. Ziegler (0042206)
22 Principal Assistant Attorney General
23 Michael.Ziegler@ohioago.gov
24 Kevin R. Walsh (0073999)
25 Senior Assistant Attorney General
26 Kevin.Walsh@ohioago.gov
27 30 East Broad Street, 14th Floor
28 Columbus, Ohio 43215
614-466-1031

DAN RAYFIELD
Attorney General
State of Oregon

/s/ John Dunbar
John J. Dunbar (Oregon Bar No. 842100)
Assistant Attorney General
Oregon Department of Justice
100 SW Market Street
Portland, Oregon 97201
Telephone: (971) 673-1880
Facsimile: (971) 673-1884
E-mail: john.dunbar@doj.oregon.gov

*Attorneys for State of Oregon ex rel.
Dan Rayfield, Attorney General*

DAVID W. SUNDAY, JR.
Attorney General
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania

/s/ Jonathan R. Burns
Jonathan R. Burns
Senior Deputy Attorney General
(PA Bar No. 315206), *pro hac vice*
Pennsylvania Office of Attorney General
Strawberry Square, 14th Floor
Harrisburg, PA 17120
717.787.3391
jburns@attorneygeneral.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the Commonwealth of
Pennsylvania*

PETER F. NERONHA
Attorney General
State of Rhode Island

/s/ Stephen N. Provazza
Stephen N. Provazza (R.I. Bar No. 10435),
pro hac vice
Assistant Attorney General
Rhode Island Office of the Attorney General
150 South Main St.
Providence, RI 02903
Phone: 401-274-4400
Email: SProvazza@riag.ri.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Rhode Island

ALAN WILSON
Attorney General
State of South Carolina

/s/ Anna C. Smith
C. Havird Jones, Jr.
Senior Assistant Deputy Attorney General
Jared Q. Libet (S.C. Bar No. 74975),

pro hac vice

Assistant Deputy Attorney General
Anna C. Smith (SC Bar No. 104749),

pro hac vice

Assistant Attorney General
Office of the South Carolina Attorney General
Post Office Box 11549
Columbia, South Carolina 29211
jlibet@scag.gov
annasmith@scag.gov
803-734-0536

*Attorneys for Plaintiff the State of South Carolina,
ex rel. Alan M. Wilson, in His Official Capacity as
Attorney General of the State of South Carolina*

MARTY J. JACKLEY

Attorney General
State of South Dakota

/s/ Amanda Miiller

By: Amanda Miiller (SD Bar No. 4271)
Deputy Attorney General
1302 East SD Hwy 1889, Suite 1
Pierre, SD 57501-8501
Telephone: (605) 773-3215
Amanda.Miiller@state.sd.us

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of South Dakota

JASON S. MIYARES

Attorney General
Commonwealth Of Virginia

/s/ Joelle E. Gotwals

Steven G. Popps
Chief Deputy Attorney General
Thomas J. Sanford
Deputy Attorney General
Richard S. Schweiker, Jr.
Senior Assistant Attorney General and Section
Chief
Joelle E. Gotwals (VSB No. 76779),
Senior Assistant Attorney General
pro hac vice

1 Chandler P. Crenshaw (VSB No. 93452)
2 Assistant Attorney General
3 *pro hac vice*
4 Office of the Attorney General of Virginia
5 Consumer Protection Section
6 202 N. 9th Street
7 Richmond, Virginia 23219
8 Telephone: (804) 786-8789
9 Facsimile: (804) 786-0122
10 E-mail: jgotwals@oag.state.va.us

11 *Attorneys for the Plaintiff Commonwealth of*
12 *Virginia*
13 *ex rel. Jason S. Miyares, Attorney General*

14 **NICHOLAS W. BROWN**
15 Attorney General State of Washington

16 /s/ Claire McNamara
17 Claire McNamara (WA Bar No. 50097)
18 Gardner Reed (WA Bar No. 55630)
19 Assistant Attorneys General
20 Washington State Office of the Attorney General
21 800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000
22 Seattle, WA 98104
23 (206) 340-6783
24 claire.mcnamara@atg.wa.gov
25 gardner.reed@atg.wa.gov

26 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Washington*

27 **JOHN B. MCCUSKEY**
28 Attorney General
State of West Virginia

/s/ Laurel K. Lackey
Laurel K. Lackey (WVSB No. 10267)
Abby G. Cunningham (WVSB No. 13388)
Assistant Attorneys General
Office of the Attorney General
Consumer Protection & Antitrust Division
Eastern Panhandle Office
269 Aikens Center
Martinsburg, West Virginia 25404

Telephone: (304) 267-0239
Email: laurel.k.lackey@wvago.gov
abby.g.cunningham@wvago.gov

*Attorneys for Plaintiff State of West Virginia, ex
rel. John B. McCuskey, Attorney General*

JOSHUA L. KAUL
Attorney General
State of Wisconsin

/s/ Brittany Copper
Brittany A. Copper
Assistant Attorney General
WI State Bar # 1142446
Wisconsin Department of Justice
Post Office Box 7857
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857
(608) 266-1795
Brittany.copper@wisdoj.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Wisconsin

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing and its attachments was served via electronic mail on November 7, 2025, to Counsel for Defendants using the email addresses designated by counsel for that purpose:

MetaNoticeofService@cov.com

SnapNoticeofService@mto.com

TikTokNoticeofService@faegredrinker.com

SERVICE-YOUTUBE-INRESOCIALMEDIAM@LIST.WSGR.COM

mdl3047coleadfirms@listserv.motleyrice.com

psc servicemdl3047@motleyrice.com

I declare under penalty of perjury of the laws of the United States that the foregoing is true and correct.

/s/ Honeyleen Bohol

Honeyleen Bohol